

Practical Implications of Local Government:

Gaps and Solutions



**Federation of Canadian Municipalities
&
South Asia Partnership-Pakistan**

Practical Implications of Local Government: Gaps and Solutions

Table of Contents

1. Back ground

Local government system in Pakistan

SAP PK's programs: SDEP, DRCEP, SDPW and DRHP

FCM Introduction

FCM & SAP-PK

2. Workshops Brief

Process Undertaken & Combined Workshops;

Urban Punjab and Rural NWFP

Rural Punjab and Rural Sindh

4 Separate Workshops:

Urban NWFP

Urban Balochistan

Rural Balochistan

Urban Sindh

3. Existing Situation and Suggestion/Recommendations

4. Consolidated Recommendations

5. The Way Ahead

Brief History of Local Bodies in Pakistan:

In the subcontinent, *Panchayat* system was used to settle down administrative and daily affairs. It was replaced by the British Raj when it introduced the concept of local bodies. In 1867, Punjab Local Government Act and the Municipal Act were approved. Moreover, in 1882, municipal laws were introduced in Punjab. Similarly, in 1883, the District Board Act was approved for rural areas. Finally, the Punjab Municipal Act (comprising 177 articles) was approved. It was revised in 1891 and now comprised of 214 articles.

In the first half of the 20th century, many new acts were introduced. In 1911, a new act was approved followed by the Panchayat Act (also known as Montague Chelmsford) for rural areas which was approved in 1912. The revised Panchayat Act was re-approved in 1921. For the first time, in 1922, the Town Committee Act was approved to facilitate smaller towns. Gradually, the system was taking its shape. In 1931, the Executive Officer's Act was approved which made it possible to nominate an executive officer.

In 1935, the Government of India Act (then the subcontinent) introduced a law for provincial autonomy. As a result, in 1939, the Punjab Government introduced an amended Panchayat Act to facilitate the rural areas. Finally, in 1941, the Lahore Corporation Act was approved which made the City the first municipal corporation of the existing Pakistan (then a part of the subcontinent).

It is important to know that before the Partition, local bodies' elections were not based on adult franchise. But, after the Partition, this was adopted as a principle. The role of Deputy Commissioners was eliminated in the district boards, but responsibility of Panchayats was given to them. This power structure damaged the Panchayat system, as the "bureaucracy" destabilized the local government and people's voice remained unheard for a long time.

In 1960, Ayub Khan issued an ordinance which introduced municipal administration order and provided bases for local bodies in Pakistan. 80,000 BD members were elected through non-party elections and were used as Electoral College for the President's election. It was divided into 4 tiers:

Rural areas:

Union Council, Tehsil Council, District Council, Divisional Council.

Cities:

Town Committee, Municipal Committee, Municipal Corporation.

Union Council:

An area with a population of 8,000 to 15,000 was considered one UC. In order to win, it was necessary for a candidate to get 1,000 to 1,500 votes. The Chairman was elected by the elected members of the UC.

Tehsil and District Council:

Tehsil Council comprised of UCs' chairmen and few government nominated members. The role of BD members was negligible at the district level. For

district council, UC was considered an Electoral College and the Deputy Commissioner headed it.

Divisional Council:

Same process carried forward to the divisional council. Divisional councilors were elected by the district councilors and headed by the Commissioner.

Local bodies were not activated during Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's rule, though the federal government issued the Peoples' Local Ordinance which remained in place in all provinces except Punjab. After two years, the Punjab Government introduced the Local Government Act, but elections were not held till Zia's regime which issued an ordinance in 1979. It remained in place till 1996. During this period, three local bodies' elections were held: in 1979, 1983 and 1991. Unfortunately, the system was never in place during elected regimes.

On 24 March 2000, Pervez Musharraf announced his plan to devolve power to the basic level with an enhanced representation of women, minorities, farmers and laborers. The plan entailed devolving main systems/functions to local tiers as stated in Ordinance 2001. In this respect, the following amendments were made:

1. Voters' age was reduced from 21 to 18 years to broaden voting base and ensure maximum participation of youth.
2. Union council will consist of 21 members: A Nazim, a Naib Nazim, 12 general seats (4 reserved for women), 6 seats for labor and peasants (2 reserved for women), and 1 seat for minorities.
3. **A Tehsil Council will consist of 34 members elected indirectly by union councilors, headed by a mayor elected by the Tehsil council. Breakdown of seats is: 25 general seats, 5 women seats, 2 labor/peasants seats and 2 minority seats for a man and a woman.**
4. The district assemblies operating under the chief mayor will have legislative powers to mobilize resources through levy of new taxes. Chief Mayor will be elected directly and will be responsible for district administration. The deputy chief mayor may act as a speaker of district assembly and will deputy the chief mayor in his absence.

South Asia Partnership-Pakistan (SAP-PK):

South Asia Partnership (SAP) is a network of participatory development-support organizations operating under the same name and for the same purposes in Canada and five South Asian countries of Bangladesh, India, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. Whereas SAP-Canada is a consortium of 26 Canadian voluntary organizations, the South Asian components are indigenous NGOs that work for the uplift of the socio-economically marginalized populations in the region.

SAP-PK is a non-sectarian, non-denominational, non-profit NGO that was founded by a group of leading Pakistani development and social activists in 1987. The organization's proper functioning started after the establishment of the secretariat two years later. SAP-PK envisages socio-economic changes aiming at the provision of equal opportunities for the full realization of human potential. It also believes that CBOs are the most effective instruments to address community problems. Such process will lead towards a more democratic environment, but lack of women participation is an issue which persists in our society since several years. Due to this, women, along with minorities and lower socio-economic groups, remain marginalized and are not fully represented in governance structures. Social biases against women find roots in deeply entrenched socio-economic deprivations in society.

To bring about a positive attitudinal change in society, SAP-PK felt it obligatory to work simultaneously at two levels: improve the existing material conditions which limited and hinder gender equality; and create awareness at both micro and macro levels to enhance women's political participation. To facilitate such a process SAP-PK initiated various programs:

SUPPORTING DEMOCRATIC ELECTORAL PROCESSES PROGRAM

The goal of SDEP Program is to contribute towards positive social change and enhancement of the socio-economic status of women through their effective participation in the political process and the governance structures. SDEP Program is a joint endeavor of five organizations, namely SAP-PK, Aurat Foundation, Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, Sawera and Election Commission of Pakistan (EC). Every partner organization plays a separate role at a different level. SAP-PK is responsible for providing training to CBOs and communities to ensure implementation of the program at the grassroots level.

The specific objectives of SDEP Program are to:

- ✚ Enable CBOs and developments activists to understand that the socialization process is usually supportive of the status quo;
- ✚ Incorporate advocacy on women issues in the agenda of CBOs as an essential element for a positive political behavior among community;
- ✚ Educate and motivate communities at the provincial and national levels to promote women participation at the level of local bodies;
- ✚ Sensitize intermediary NGOs and develop capacities for working on issues related to gender, politics and development; and
- ✚ Sensitize and lobby with the political parties, especially their women wings.

DEMOCRATIC RIGHTS AND CITIZENS' EDUCATION PROGRAM

Moving ahead, SAP-PK had launched Democratic Rights and Citizens' Education program (DRCEP) with the active support of four other national level NGOs, SUNGI Foundation, PILER, IDSP and SDPI, in 2000. DRCEP was implemented in 106 districts of the country through the available infrastructure NGOs and other civil society groups. Focus of the program was to promote political education among people in order to increase their participation in electoral process, besides promoting the concept of good governance through a process of democratic and electoral education of citizens. A large number of voters (mainly women, peasants and workers) were educated through various activities under this program. The emphasis was on empowering marginalized sections of the society, especially women, small farmers, laborers and minorities, in order to enhance their political representation at various levels of decision-making.

During this, the government announced final version of Local Government Plan (LGP), which inculcates setting up of local tiers of governance, from union council to district council levels. The plan also reserves 33% seats for women at various tiers of government. Moreover, seats are also reserved for peasants, laborers and minorities. Through this program, SAP-PK tried to raise some crucial issues pertaining to democratic and political rights of the citizens, and helped candidates aspiring to contest elections on the seats reserved for women, farmers, workers and minorities.

A series of public mobilization, interactive theatre and other educational activities were organized in the districts where elections were held. Material on basic democratic issues was also widely distributed among voters and general public. During the campaign, 38 districts focal points were formed and given detailed orientation on the philosophy, objectives, methodology and activities of DRCEP and LGP. Later, *Tehsil* and sub-division level teams were also formed to further diversify the activities to local populations. In each district, about 100 activists were directly involved in this process of public education.

Democracy and Human Rights Program

South Asia Partnership-Pakistan also realized that, for a democratic political environment in Pakistan, political parties, journalists, media person, and minority groups need to be also mobilized. With this specific concern, along with other NGOs in Pakistan, a project has been initiated to support the general election process, due to take place in 2002. The project will contribute to re-establish people confidence in institutions and electoral processes and increase people awareness of and participation to the general election. T

Three target groups have been identified: (i) media and journalists, (ii) political parties and candidates and (iii) minorities. Two cross cutting issues of utmost importance in Pakistan, gender and young people, will be mainstreamed in all activities being undertaken within the context of the project. Taking place throughout the countries, activities will include sensitizations of political party leaders and members, promotion of public debates, advocacy for the redaction of a political party code of conduct, training of journalists, media monitoring and sensitization of minorities. With the project, the civil society capacities will be enhanced and its role in the democratic process promoted.

Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM)

The Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) is an independent, not-for-profit organization which represents more than 700 municipal government members from every part of Canada. The principal function of the Federation of Canadian Municipalities is the representation and pursuit of the common national interests of all Canadian municipalities, vis-à-vis the Government of Canada. FCM conducts research, develops policies, and through appropriate mechanisms takes action on matters of national municipal concern. FCM thus serves as the central linkage among Canadian municipalities and municipal associations.

The FCM operates a number of standing committees and task forces which address policy issues of national municipal interest focusing on economic development, environmental issue, municipal finance, national transportation, community safety and crime prevention, municipal infrastructure, national northern and remote communities, housing, race relations, community energy systems, municipal aboriginal relations, the future of municipal government and international programming.

The FCM delivers a wide range of services and programs to its membership. For example, FCM entered into a debate with the Federal Government on the Goods and Services Tax and negotiated the municipal GST rebate rate. In the course of the constitutional debate, the FCM made presentations to the Federal Government lobbying for the constitutional status of Canadian municipalities.

The Federation also provides opportunities for dialogue between Canadian municipalities and cities abroad. While FCM respects the central position of the federal and provincial governments in international relations, FCM assumes a lead role in representing Canadian municipal interests at the international level by fostering relationships between municipal associations and Canadian municipal governments and their respective counterparts in other countries.

FCM & SAP-PK:

The Local Government Plan 2000 has provided the framework for democracy, local empowerment and good governance. Enhancing the role of marginalized groups in political and social spheres of the country has been at the centre of LGP. South Asia Partnership (SAP-PK) and its partner organizations have been striving to support the transition to democracy and to enhance the democratic and political role of these section of the society. From 1995 to 2000 SAP-PK and its partner organizations have worked closely with community based organizations, political parties, and other civil society organizations to train local leaders, and to hold dialogues and advocacy campaigns with political party leadership and workers, as well as other opinion makers of the society. These dialogues were focused on changing roles of vulnerable sections, particularly women and workers in the political and governance spheres of the country.

Peace and Progress in the region was the idea behind the new local government system. It is in place since last 8 months in 104 districts of Pakistan and a large number of women, peasants, laborers, minority councilors are playing their role in it. However, the ground conditions have changed and in these changed circumstances there is a need to help and train these newly elected councilors and the local leaders, so that they can perform their role in these councils more effectively. Training and education of these councilors will help to build a conducive environment for citizens in general, and these marginalized group in particular, to perform their role as social change agents. Dialogue among elected councilors, community activists, and line departments will help strengthen democratic tradition and make the devolution a success.

At the moment, there is a problem of unclear roles and responsibilities for key actors involved in the devolution plan. The elected councilors, Mayor (Nazim) and deputy Mayor (Niab Nazim) and bureaucracy are going through a phase where lack of clarity and a newness of the system are creating confusion. In addition there is general lack of clarity as to the changing relationships and responsibilities between the local, provincial and federal levels.

In response to a request for Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) assistance from the government of Pakistan-National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB), two assessment missions were undertaken: Nov-Dec 2000 and April-May 2001. The assessment revealed that GOP has achieved major progress in a number of key reform sectors, although it has been constrained by the pervasive lack of capacity in the public and civil sectors, and the lack of education and dialogue between various local actors.

This has called for the importance of increasing the local institutional capacity and supporting dialogue between all the actors to help resolve the confusion, and wherever necessary, bring in the technical support to help address the issues. FCM had asked SAP-PK to support the dialogue between various partners, as they are in a position to talk to the communities, elected representatives, government line departments, and at the same time bring the federal government and the National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) in the discussion to address the issue.

Workshops Brief

Process undertaken: Under the Terms of Reference for the Contract between South Asia Partnership-Pakistan (SAP-PK) and the Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM), 8 workshops on *Practical Implications of Local Government System* were organized with the coordination of SAP-PK's partners.



Initial plan was to organize separate workshops for all the eight focal groups, formed in four urban (one in each province) and four rural (one in each province) communities. But, due to time constraints, it was decided to conduct the combine the first 4 workshops in two (groups were invited simultaneously). Remaining four focal groups were conducted in their own provinces separately.

Another change in the initial plan was that the number of days of workshops were reduced from two to only one. This change was envisaged considering that: 1) It was difficult for most of the participants to be away from their busy routines for more days; and 2) Most of them had already participated in political education programs of SAP-PK as well as other organizations, and had a pretty fair idea of the Local Government System and their roles and responsibilities under the present Local Government Plan (LGP). This made it quite easy to solicit their views on how practical the LGP was and what were the difficulties of practical dimensions that were hindering their work.

Workshops were facilitated by Irfan Mufti, Mustafa Nazir, Shabnam Rashid, Saleem Khan and Mohammed Saeed and coordinated by SAP-PK's partners. The process carried forward was as follows:

1. Participants' detailed introduction,
2. The procedures of UCs, roles and responsibilities of the elected representatives were given in detail.
3. Participants were asked to reflect on the existing situation of local government system and highlight its shortcomings.
4. Accordingly, possible interfaces and suggestions were made.

ombined workshops:

Urban Punjab, Rural NWFP Meeting was organized at Lahore on 26th January 2002. The participants included members of the focal groups from two Union Councils (UCs) – UC Pandori Kalan, Gujranwala (Urban Punjab) and UC Sri Bahlol, Takht Bhai (Rural NWFP). These focal groups, which had been formed earlier during visit to the respective



communities, offered a right balance of elected representatives (mostly women councilors, but also councilors elected on seats reserved for peasants and workers), community activists and officials of government line departments. Interestingly, *Nazim* of UC Sri Bahlol and some members of district and *tehsil* councils also participated in the workshop. In all, 35 participants (18 women, 17 men) attended the workshop. The size of the focal group from UC Sri Bahlol was 18 (11 men, 7 women) while that of UC Pandori Kalan was 17 (11 women, 6 men).

Elected Representatives

Category	UC Sri Bahlol	UC Pandori Kalan
General Councilors (M)	3	1
General Councilors (F)	3	5
Peasant/Albor (M)	1	
Peasant/Labor (F)	0	3
Minority		
Niab Nazim		
Nazim		1
Total	7	10

Rural Punjab, Rural Sindh

It was organized in Lahore on 17 March 2002. The participants included



members of the focal groups from two Union Councils (UCs) – UC Nawab Pur, Multan (Rural Punjab) and UC Mondar, Dadu (Rural Sindh). These focal groups, that had been formed earlier during visit to the respective communities, offered a right balance of elected representatives and community activists. Interestingly, *Nazim* and *Naib Nazim* of UC Mondar also participated in the workshop, which was attended by 44 participants (26

men, 18 women) in all.

Elected Representatives

Category	UC Nawab Pur	
General Councilors (M)	1	4
General Councilors (F)	0	4
Peasant/Albor (M)	0	0
Peasant/Labor (F)	1	0
Minority	1	0
Niab Nazim		1
Nazim		1
Total	3	10

4 Separate Workshops:

Urban NWFP-Peshawar

It was organized on 5th April 2002 at Peshawar with the collaboration of Human Resource Management & Development Centre. The participants represented various segments of the society and included professionals like advocates, bankers, trade unionists, farmers, property dealers, laborers, teachers, doctors, businessmen, transporters and minority representatives. The meeting was attended by 20 participants including a nazim, 2 naib nazims as well as civil society representatives.



Elected Representatives

Category	UC 33 Lundi Arbab	UC37 Town 111	UC 38 Tehkal Payan 1	UC39 Tehkal Payan 2	UC 42 Malakandher	UC 44 Hayatabad-2	UC 81 Academy Town
General Councilors (M)				1	1	1	
General Councilors (F)	1					1	
Peasant/ Albor (M)	1	1	1				
Peasant/ Labor (F)						1	
Minority		1					1
Niab Nazim	1				1		
Nazim				1			
Total	3	2	1	2	2	3	1

Urban Balochistan ZHOB: It was organized on 9 April 2002 in ZOB with the collaboration of DAY-Zob. The participants represented various segments of the society and included professionals like agriculturist, traders, transporter, teachers, meson government contractor, dairy farmer, general store keeper, housewives, midwife, journalists, and sweeper-minority representatives. The meeting was attended by 32 participants including a 5 Nazims, Niab Nazim as well as civil society representatives.



Elected Representatives

Category	District Council	Tehsil Council Sambaza Bader	UC Babo Mohalla	UC Nasir Ababad Zob	UC Mani Khawa	UC Islam Yar	Hasan Zai Zob	Laka band	Gunj Mohallah	Kakro Kharasan
General Councilors (M)				1						
General Councilors (F)	2	1	2	3		1				
Peasant/ Albor (M)									1	
Peasant/ Labor (F)			1							
Minority										1
Niab Nazim		1			1					
Nazim				1	1	1	1	1		
Total	2	2	3	5	2	2	1	1	1	1

Rural Balochistan-Loralai

It was organized on 10 April 2002 at Loralai in collaboration with DAY-Loralai.



The participants represented various segments of the society and included professionals like social worker, Mechanic, teachers, tailor, journalists, business men, electrician, trader, nadir representative (military government formed this department for computerized data of citizens), house wives, government servant, students and minority

representatives.

The meeting was attended by 30 participants including 1 *nazim*, 2 *naib nazim* and the civil society representatives.

Elected Representatives

Category	Loralai	Killi Bawar Nasraan	Sadar Bazaar Loralai	Oriyaigai	Cheena Ali zai	Phari Mohallah	Azgharnoon	Circal 1	Circal2	Circal3	Circal 7
General Councilors (M)		1	2		1	1	1	3			
General Councilors (F)										1	
Peasant/ Albor (M)											
Peasant/ Labor (F)	1								2		
Minority								1		1	
Niab Nazim				1							1
Nazim											
Total	1	1	2	1	1	1	1	4	2	2	1



media coordinator of district council. The meeting was attended by 26 participants.

Urban Sindh-Hyderabad

It was organized on 13 April 2002 at Hyderabad in collaboration with Sindh Development Society. The Participants represented various segments of the society and included professionals like Computer composers & engineer, Journalists, social worker, Lawyers,



Women Councilors Hyderabad

Elected representatives

Category	Latifaabad UC 7	Hyderabad city UC9	Hyderabad city UC15	District Council
<i>General Councilors (M)</i>				
<i>General Councilors (F)</i>	1	1	2	
<i>Peasant/Albor (M)</i>				
<i>Peasant/Labor (F)</i>	1	1	2	
<i>Minority</i>		1		
<i>Niab Nazim</i>				
<i>Nazim</i>				
<i>Media coordinator</i>				1
Total	2	3	4	1

EXISTING SITUATION and SUGGESTION/RECOMMENDATIONS
Urban Punjab, Rural NWFP

PROPOSED FUNCTIONS	EXISTING SITUATION	SUGGESTION/RECOMMENDATIONS
1. Assist tehsil council in creation of village and neighborhood councils	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Not formed ▪ Govt. officials unclear about them ▪ Provincial Local Government Committee for complaints not formed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Should be formed by UC ▪ Election schedule should be made by UC ▪ Village/Neighborhood councils are not required as the councilors should do this work
2. Maintenance of government property	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ It is being considered unimportant as no mechanism has been adopted for its implementation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Importance should be felt and awareness should be imparted ▪ A committee comprising local people should be formed for this purpose
3. Monitor the performance of union administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ There are examples of both good and bad relationship between elected representatives and union administration ▪ Union monitoring committees not formed ▪ Lack of clarity regarding roles and responsibilities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Roles and responsibilities should be clearly defined ▪ A monitoring committee should be formed
4. Monitor the performance of UC members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No committee formed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A committee should be formed to monitor conduct of UC members ▪ <i>Tehsil</i> and district councils should monitor UC
5. Creation of monitoring committees of the union on health, justice, education, finance, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Committee for finance not formed as there are no funds ▪ Confusion between UC and <i>tehsil</i> council over funds 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UC should have the powers to monitor government departments and make changes ▪ Revenue generated from activities like festivals and <i>melas</i> should be at the disposal of the concerned UC, not of district or <i>tehsil</i> council
6. Community Mobilization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Open <i>kutcheris</i> are being organized ▪ Not done around social issues 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UC should run campaign for community mobilization in collaboration with local groups
7. Prepare annual development schemes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Limited funds are spent on unanimously-decided most important need ▪ Proposals of development schemes have been submitted to <i>tehsil</i> and district councils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Councilors should present proposals after consultation with his constituents ▪ Funds for development schemes should be increased
8. Prepare annual budget	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No mechanism of revenue and tax collection exists at UC level ▪ Rural UCs lack technical expertise for this 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Budget can be made from the grants received from <i>tehsil</i> and district council ▪ Capital Value Tax, levied on selling of land of 8 <i>marlas</i>

		<p>or more, should be given to UC</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UC should have its own mechanism of revenue and tax collection, and the authority to hire technical expertise from outside
9. Plantation of trees/ De-silting of Canals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No committee exists ▪ Lack of awareness in people regarding environment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A committee on environment should be formed ▪ Councilors should be imparted orientation on environment
10. Facilitate poverty reduction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Initial work done through Khushali Bank 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The mark-up rate on loans should be low and they should be in easy installments ▪ Elected representatives should be briefed on the <i>Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper</i> and <i>Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility</i>
11. Approve rates and fees for services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The areas have not been identified and no concrete work is being done 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UC should decide rates and fees for services in consultation with experts
12. Facilitate formation and functioning of citizen community boards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Not formed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Should be formed immediately and experts should be involved

Rural Punjab, Rural Sindh

PROPOSED FUNCTIONS	EXISTING SITUATION	SUGGESTION/RECOMMENDATIONS
1. Assist tehsil council in creation of village and neighborhood councils	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Not formed ▪ Lack of government interest ▪ No discussion held so far ▪ Elected councilors as well as <i>Nazims/Naib Nazims</i> unclear 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Should be formed by UC in consultation with local people ▪ Election should be held through UC even if the schedule is announced by <i>tehsil</i> council ▪ Selection – not election – is a better solution because of small villages/neighborhoods ▪ People from areas which have no representation in UCs should be taken on these councils
2. Maintenance of government property	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No discussion held so far ▪ No earlier record maintained 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Civil Society Organizations should provide this information to UCs ▪ Record of government property should be maintained at UC level
3. Monitor the performance of union administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Monitoring committees formed in some UCs and meetings are held ▪ District government has also formed a committee 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Monitoring committee comprising community members should be formed
4. Monitor the performance of UC members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No committee or authority formed so far 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Monitoring committee comprising community members and representatives of CBOs/ NGOs and civil society organizations should be formed
5. Creation of monitoring committees of the union on health, justice, education, finance, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No selection criteria for representation on these committees (even unqualified people are heading them) ▪ Committees have been formed in most areas comprising members of UCs ▪ Playing very limited role as their members are unaware of their role ▪ No funds for activities so far 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Community members should be involved in these committees ▪ Qualified people/Professionals should be inducted in these committees ▪ Training by experts should be provided to committee members
6. Community Mobilization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No committee formed so far ▪ Negative attitude of local government towards CBOs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Should be done through village/neighborhood councils ▪ Media should be involved and encouraged to take up issues innovatively ▪ At the government level, enabling atmosphere should be created for people's motivation through CBOs/NGOs

7. Prepare annual development schemes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Schemes prepared after <i>tehsil</i>/district councils invited proposals, but not discussed in house for prioritization ▪ Budget divided among councilors, each getting Rs. 40,000-50,000 ▪ No meeting held with district government officials so far ▪ Information shared only through District Coordinating Officers (DCO), who at times hide it 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Experts, having an experience in preparing development schemes, should be involved ▪ More resources should be allocated for development schemes ▪ Elected representatives should have the required information ▪ For broader representation, women and people having interests and stakes should be involved
8. Prepare annual budget	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No budget allocated so far, only grants ▪ Committees on tax formed in most UCs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Budget can be made from the grants received from <i>tehsil</i> and district council ▪ UC should have its own mechanism of revenue and tax collection, and the authority to hire technical expertise from outside
9. Plantation of trees/ De-silting of Canals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No new plan so far ▪ Lack of awareness among people regarding environment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A committee on environment should be formed ▪ Councilors should be imparted orientation on environment
10. Facilitate poverty reduction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Khushali Bank not discussed in meetings ▪ Khushali Banks are located in district headquarters, and are often far from people's reach ▪ No planning in this regard so far at UC level 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Khushali Banks should be formed at village level and there should be a branch in every UC ▪ Khushali Bank should give loans through people's committees
12. Facilitate formation and functioning of citizen community boards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No information so far and never discussed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Awareness and training should be imparted ▪ Civil society organizations should be involved

Urban NWFP-Peshawar

PROPOSED FUNCTIONS	EXISTING SITUATION	SUGGESTION/RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>1. Assist tehsil council in creation of village and neighborhood councils</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Due to lack of resources UC's office are mostly not in place, so the village/neighborhood councils are not assisted. ▪ Council's monthly meeting is undertaking in Hujra's, which stops women councilors to participate UC's meetings (in most of the cases they were not even invited). ▪ Councilor's have no authority, District Nazim have all the power, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs Nazim should write to District Nazim and point out the available government land to be acquired UCs office'. ▪ Funds must be provided to establish UC's office to facilitate women councilor's for joining meetings. ▪ Amendments in ordinance were proposed for granting authority to councilors at UC level.
<p>2. Maintenance of government property</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Govt. officials, Federal and Provincial institutions are not coordinating due to lack of mechanism. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Sate must educate various federal and provincial institutions for a more collaborated and constructive role for UCs.
<p>3. Monitor the performance of union administration</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Relationship between elected representatives and union administration is not constructive, Police is not in coordination with UC, ▪ No respect for UC's especially councilors at the upper Tehsil and District level. ▪ DCO and District Nazim's pay no attention to UC. ▪ Tehsil, Municipal Officer/Chief Officer and others' are not cooperative as the demand made by UC's to provide facilities were not taken seriously by government officers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Coordination mechanism which is the part of existing ordinance 2001 need to practically implemented ▪ Councilors must have appropriate representation at district and Tehsil level. ▪ To monitor district Nazim and DCO performance /attitude the system as explained in ordinance must be placed in an immediate effect.
<p>4. Monitor the performance of UC members</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UC's are not functioning properly so no need to monitor the performance ▪ Committee' don't exist 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Necessary resources/input should be provided immediately and then monitor the performance.
<p>5. Creation of monitoring committees of the union on health, justice, education, finance, etc.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Finance Committee has not formed yet. ▪ Committees are not formed ▪ UCs' councilors have no authority to monitor these institutions. ▪ Councilors themselves are mostly not educated 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Committee need to be made immediately. ▪ UC should have the powers to monitor government departments for a constructive changes ▪ Councilor's education program must be initiated.

6. Community Mobilization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Due to lack of resources and the development initiatives, electorate are getting disappointed and losing confidence in the system. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Independent funds must be allocated to women councilors to avoid such complications ▪ Awareness regarding this newly formed system must be given to civil society
7. Prepare annual development schemes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Lack of Resources and lack of UC's office it's not possible to develop it. ▪ Few reported that Nazim's with out councilors' consent are preparing development schemes. ▪ Largely UCs were not provided funds. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Immediately UC's office needs to be placed. ▪ Government land to be occupied for UC's offices ▪ Nazims must seek consent of councilors before preparing development schemes. ▪
8. Prepare annual budget	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CMDD (city municipal development department) has control over funds (Malik Saads' monopoly all over Peshawar), ▪ Honoraria of Nazim and Niab Nazim was viewed as unjust to entire system (it is being provided from development funds), 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To avoid misuse of funds CMDD should be abolished. ▪ For minority independent budget must be allocated for sanitation wedding and funeral halls. ▪ Demand of councilors' stipend was made sincerely ▪ Honoraria of Nazim and Niab Nazim must be given from District Council instead of development funds ▪
9. Plantation of trees/ De-silting of Canals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Irregular UC's are not able to undertaker such important activities, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Need to be educated about the resources available.
10. Facilitate poverty reduction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Not existed due to lack of the facilitative atmosphere by government and District Nazim, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ District Council should released funds to undertake such an important task. ▪ Special Zakat committee needs to be formed to eradicate poverty,
11. Approve rates and fees for services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Yet we haven't done it, Every thing is being planed by District Nazim, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Revenue generated from activities like festivals and <i>melas</i> should be at the disposal of respective UCs but not at the district or tehsil council level.
12. Facilitate formation and functioning of citizen community boards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Only in papers. ▪ Nazims themselves deciding about the committees. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Rule and regulation must be followed to formulate citizen board. ▪ District Mohtasib, and Local body commission immediately need to be established

Urban Balochistan ZHOB

PROPOSED FUNCTIONS	EXISTING SITUATION	SUGGESTION/RECOMMENDATIONS
1. Assist tehsil council in creation of village and neighborhood councils	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Local government elections looks like a dream to us as still we don't have UCs offices and one of us is still doesn't get his councilor's identification paper. ▪ Lack of resources mostly UCs office are not in place, so village/neighborhood councils have yet not created. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Allocation of funds should be granted immediately for UC offices.
2. Maintenance of government property	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs members are not aware of rules & regulation as described in local government ordinance 2001. ▪ As all such institutions are largely under National and Provincial autonomy so elected representatives have no legal authority to monitor or maintain them. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Easy version of Ordinance 2001 and the training must be provided to all UCs. ▪ <i>Question of decentralization can be solved by just linking defense, finance, external and interior institutions with federal government and all other institutions ideally need to be linked with provincial and accordingly at district and then union council level.</i>
3. Monitor the performance of union administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Because of imbalance of the given authority local government system is in danger (among bureaucracy and local government representatives). ▪ Lack of smooth functioning among elected members and the union administration is the key problem. ▪ Performance (as quoted that we have no authority even to say any thing to <i>Tehsildar in favor of peoples' benefit.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ To create balance among these two, government should work our in practice not only in papers for a more effective system. ▪ <i>Elected representatives strongly suggested for UCs legal monitoring role in all such institutions which have direct effect on in their particular constituency.</i> ▪ UC, Tehsil and then district council should be provided legal rights to transfer DCO while forwarding no confidence move and if its' get approved with simple majority then action must be taken immediately
4. Monitor the performance of UC members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ As a matter of fact if UCs don't exists then monitoring the performance of UC members become irrelevant question. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs need to be in real term strengthened as described in ordinance 2001.
5. Creation of monitoring committees of the union on health, justice, education, finance, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Don't exists 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Need to develop it immediately. ▪ Education and Health institution should be under UC for a healthy environment which can serve ordinary citizen. ▪ Special allocation of funds/resources for remote areas in the field of education.
6. Community Mobilization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Lack of the resources its' not possible for them to mobilize people, as they raised questions about UCs progress. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Need to initiate motivational campaign among communities with the focus on education especially for women.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary education should be compulsory for each citizen. As an incentive scholarship for primary educated girls can be introduced to convince tribal belt regarding women education.
7. Prepare annual development schemes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of knowledge about rules of business, laws and the available resources it's not possible to fulfill any task (<i>Shamus-ul- Haq- Nazim Hasan Zai Zob pointed out the pen and the copy given to them before the meeting and strongly commented that UCs has not earned any thing till now except this</i>). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Resources for UCs development schemes must be provided. Training need to be given to all UCs members.
8. Prepare annual budget	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Changes made in no confidence move against Nazim "from 6 to 12 months" created nepotism. In reference to limited resources, <i>Nazar Khan Mandokhel with a bitter tone said if government has little resources then how it is possible for government to help Afghanistan or provide funds for army.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Immediately need to abolish this restriction.</i> Need to review laws to strengthen entire UCs instead of individual or district council. Independent budget allocation for women councilors to undertake their responsibilities.
9. Plantation of trees/ De-silting of Canals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not aware of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need to be educated
10. Facilitate poverty reduction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> With out resources its' not possible. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Banks and other government schemes need to be linked with UCs directly.</i>
11. Approve rates and fees for services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 	
12. Facilitate formation and functioning of citizen community boards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not yet existed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need to be formed.

Rural Balochistan-Loralai

PROPOSED FUNCTIONS	EXISTING SITUATION	SUGGESTION/RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>1. Assist tehsil council in creation of village and neighborhood councils</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comparison between previous and present LGP: Decentralization of power plan is so complicated to be understood. Compare to this previous system was easy as we have some understanding of it. As quoted <i>“It looks like its’ easy to experiment any thing in Pakistan so now we will experiment new system for next 50 years perhaps”</i>. • Lack of trained and educated people complications emerged • Horse trading is on its’ way • Women are not ever being invited for meetings if ever conducted 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training must be provided but in a more simplistic manner than before. • Separate training place for women councilors is suggested. • Must take proactive measures: oppositions’ role was strongly recommended for a constructive atmosphere.
<p>2. Maintenance of government property</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of coordination among various institutions and the elected body 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Question of decentralization can be solved by linking defense, finance, external and interior institutions with federal government and all other institutions ideally need to be linked with provincial and accordingly at district and then union council level. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ With out the above mentioned such an important task cannot be fulfill.
<p>3. Monitor the performance of union administration</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Lack of authority to monitor the performance of union administration is the key issue. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Elected representatives strongly suggested for UCs legal monitoring role in all such institutions which have direct effect in their particular constituency
<p>4. Monitor the performance of UC members</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ With out any resources, nothing had been done so far so it becomes irrelevant to monitor UCs performance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ With the initiation of assigned tasks it must be done.
<p>5. Creation of monitoring committees of the union on health, justice, education, finance, etc.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Only paper work. District committees existed but Nazim is the hindrance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ District Nazims’ role must be abolish in the formation of <i>district committees especially, safety commission</i> ▪ Government must attract donors for education project in Balochistan. However, officially women primary education must be declared essential.
<p>6. Community Mobilization</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Community motivation at the moment is not possible as we haven’t done any thing for them. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs must initiate awareness campaigns and raise consciousness about education especially women education.

<p>7. Prepare annual development schemes</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • District Nazim allocated resources and they have developed development schemes but, later provincial governments cancelled all the funds allocated earlier. ▪ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Funds and development projects should be provided by the government at UCs level. ▪ UCs must be granted authority to develop and get the approval for their annual development schemes.
<p>8. Prepare annual budget</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • District Nazim took only 15 minutes for the approval of budget. • At the moment budget allocation is unjust: 40% for District Nazim (can be used on discretionary power), 35% tehsil, and 25% UCs. • Local government system resulted another ruling elite in the shape of district nazims as quoted by the participants (<i>Initially we just have to face an authoritarian behavior of bureaucracy but now we have district Nazims as well</i>). • Lack of local government commission and district Mohtasib: DCO and District Nazim is in collaboration where as UCs are facing problem at all level. Public safety commission's notification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Opposition role was strongly recommended for a constructive atmosphere. ▪ Direct and large chunk of the budget must be allocated to UCs accordingly: 80% of the budget for UC, 10% for Tehsil and 10% for district council. ▪ For the right balance it was suggested to lesser the district nazim authority/powers and gives it to UCs. ▪
<p>9. Plantation of trees/ De-silting of Canals</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No comments or not aware of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No suggestions
<p>10. Facilitate poverty reduction</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Federal Government & Local government system: Federal government's (especially Pervez Musharraf get hold of Nazims) always contact or invite only to districts Nazims whereas, remaining elected body is totally ignored. Due to this nepotism is at its' peak. • With out any resources and authority/access at federal level can't fulfill this job: 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ NRB must visit 3 levels and explain their roles and authority vis-à-vis seek information. ▪ District Nazim must seek UCs and Tehsil Councils opinion as compulsion before joining any meeting at federal level before forming any opinion. Secondly, if District Nazim wants to reflect his/her own opinion, he/she must reflect it accordingly.
<p>11. Approve rates and fees for services</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ We don't have any authority, at the level that we can't attest ID Card . 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Union Council must be authorized for taxation independently in respective constituency.
<p>12. Facilitate formation and functioning of citizen community boards</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Not in place. All paper work. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ As an immediate effect <i>citizens community boards</i> need to be formed.

Urban Sindh-Hyderabad

PROPOSED FUNCTIONS	EXISTING SITUATION	SUGGESTION/RECOMMENDATIONS
1. Assist tehsil council in creation of village and neighborhood councils	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Councilors are being ignored and Nazim has all the power. ▪ Councilors have no authority, ▪ Not yet assisted, 	<p>Authority as described in ordinance with an immediate effect needs to be provided.</p> <p>Moreover, authority should be retransferred to councilors.</p> <p><i>Village and Neighborhood councils should be developed with immediate effects.</i></p>
2. Maintenance of government property	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Due to the lack of legal monitoring role UCs representatives are totally ignored. In this reference recent incidence was quoted: Commercial building had been constructed in the premises of Sindh Law collage. When as member of UCs we asked to stop it. They told us that we have no authority to stop them. ▪ <i>Councilors reports are not treated seriously.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Federal level notification with the necessary explanation need to be issued to all the institutions for their facilitative role.
3. Monitor the performance of union administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Lack of coordinated role UCs has no say. DCO is not cooperating with District Nazim. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs legal monitoring role in all such institutions which have direct effect in their particular constituency was suggested. Moreover, it was suggested to authorize UCs to transfer the incompetent officer. ▪ The resolutions passed by UCs must be honored by DCO.
4. Monitor the performance of UC members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Councilors training were not sufficient as instructor was not aware of written material. ▪ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Need to organize training ▪ Monitoring system can be handed over to NGOs as suggested by female labor councilor. ▪ A committee should be formed with the notables of area for monitor the performance of UC members.
5. Creation of monitoring committees of the union on health, justice, education, finance, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Education, health and Justice Committees have been formed but lack coordination. ▪ Health committee chairman is a business person, ▪ Patients especially women are facing problems as most of the UCs offices are either in maternity homes or in the hospital. ▪ Media coordinator is the son of district Niab Nazim son. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All UCs committees' chairpersons must meet once a month with district committees' chairperson. In this meeting EDO, responsible officer from related institution must be invited and suggestions need to be forward to councils and to the respective office ▪ Professional people should head such committees ▪ Need to establish UCs office some where else. ▪ .Improvements in government schools must be made by UCs with an authority in hand.

6. Community Mobilization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Lack of information creates problems for people ▪ Children are being ignored by all of us, and on the top of it <i>Madrisas</i> are misleading them. ▪ We have forgotten the pioneers (Older people's experience are not being used for social construction) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Need to aware people in relation to their problems and its possible solutions. ▪ Need to initiate awareness campaign with the primary focus on children (at the primary school level) and try to build their constructive role in society (we may each them traffic discipline). ▪ Retired and older people's experience need to be taped by UCs for the overall development.
7. Prepare annual development schemes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ What ever little effort made in this respect and forwarded to Tehsil Council. It has been stuck at the Tehsil level. UCs lacks authority and resources which are important factors for a successful completion of any tasks. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs' Nazim must be authorized to take action or decide accordingly. ▪
8. Prepare annual budget	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Lack of resources ▪ The main problem lies with the system, as UC have to collect resources and then handed over to Tehsil and then from top budget will be allocated for UCs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs should be authorized to use the resources they generate/collect. ▪ Moreover, in underdeveloped UCs special funds need to be allocated by district councils.
9. Plantation of trees / Disilting of Canals	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Suggestions were sent to Tehsil Council, but nothing happened yet. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No suggestions,
10. Facilitate poverty reduction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Same response as development scheme. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ UCs need to be strengthen to fulfill this task.
11. Approve rates and fees for services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No authority 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Union councils should be given the authority to collect and generate revenue. Especially UCs should impose tax on super and general store.
12. Facilitate formation and functioning of citizen community boards		

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

NEPOSTISM AND LOCAL BODY SYSTEM

NO Confidence Move & Nepotism: Amendments made in regard to no confidence move against Nazim 'shift from 6 months to 12 months' as announced by the present regime. The change promotes nepotism

Federal Government & Local government system: Federal government's (especially Pervez Musharraf get hold of Nazims) always contacts or invite districts Nazims but rest of the elected body had been ignored. Nepotism is at its' peak.

Political affiliation, District Nazim, Nepotism and Referendum: Local government system resulted another another type of authority over us. Initially we just have to face an authoritarian behavior of bureaucracy and now district Nazim as well. Moreover, they viewed UCs Nazim as a contractor of District Nazim.



Authoritarian Behavior and District Nazim: Local government system created another type of authority over us. Initially we just have to face an authoritarian behavior of bureaucracy but now we have district Nazims as well. : DCO and District Nazim is in collaboration where as UCs are facing problem at all level.

✚ To create balance, district Nazims' authority/powers should be transferred at Union Council level

- ✚ Opposition role was strongly recommended for a constructive atmosphere.
- ✚ Local Government Commission and District Mohtasib as narrated in local government ordinance immediately need to be in placed.

Decentralization & Local Body System

Knowledge is half knowledge and experience is half: It was quoted while reflecting on the decentralization of power plan. As they say, present situation is complicated compare to the previous system (it looks like its' really easy to experiment any thing/any new idea in Pakistan. So now we will perhaps experiment this new system for the next 50 years).



Bleak situation of the local government system: Imbalance of authority among

bureaucracy and local government representatives. Prevailing situation is the hindrance for smooth and a successful local government system.

- ✚ It was suggested that UC, Tehsil and then district council must be provided legal authority to transfer DCO. For this the suggested mechanism is to forward a no confidence move and with the simple majority get it approve. For the implementation of all such decision district Session Judge should provide an authority for the implementation of all approved resolutions of UC, Tehsil and district councils.

Monitor the performance of union administration

- ✚ **Elected representatives strongly suggested for UCs legal monitoring role in all such institutions which have direct effect in their particular constituency.**

Lack of coordination among various institutions and the elected body

- ✚ Question of decentralization can be solved by linking defense, finance, external and interior institutions with federal government and all other institutions ideally need to be linked with provincial, district and union council level.

Equal Opportunity & Budget allocation:

Funds & UCs: The main problem lies with the system, as UC have to collect resources and then handed over to Tehsil and then from top budget will be allocated for UCs. Moreover, mechanism of revenue and tax collection dose not exists at UC level.

- Funds & Peshawar: According to Dr. Mehmmod-ul-Hassan Niab Nazim UC 33-Lundi Arbab that City Municipal Development Department (CMDD) has control over funds in Peshawar ((Malik Saads' monopoly all over Peshawar), whereas no such department exists elsewhere in Pakistan. Due to this inappropriate and misuse of funds is the real problem for Peshawar local body system.



- ✚ **CMDD need to be Immediately close in Peshawar.**
- ✚ *UCs should be authorized to use the resources they generate/collect. moreover, underdeveloped UCs special funds need to be granted/ allocated by the District Councils.*
- ✚ *Capital value tax, levied on selling of land of 8 **Marlas** or more, should be given to UC.*
- ✚ *UC should have its own mechanism of revenue and tax collection, and the authority to hire technical expertise from outside*

Facilitate poverty reduction & development schemes: What ever little effort made in this respect and forwarded to Tehsil Council. It has been stuck at the Tehsil level. UCs lacks authority and resources which are important factors for a successful

completion of any tasks. Moreover, it was highlighted that the Khushali Banks are only located in district headquarters, and are often far from people's reach.

- ✚ Briefing on Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility must be given to elected representatives
- ✚ Banks and other government schemes should be directly linked with UCs.
- ✚ Khushali Banks should be formed at village and UC level, which will provided loans through people's committees. Moreover, UCs' Nazim must be authorized to take action in favor of respective cnstituencies.

Right to information & Education:

Lack of knowledge and training: Two types of Ordinance's documents created problems for them. Urdu version of ordinance 2001 "local body plan" must be provided at all levels especially to all in simple Urdu to all UCs. ON the top of that, the training being provided was not helpful for most of them especially, for the illiterate councilor.

Lack of trained councilors: *Mostly Nazims have political background where as councilors are primarily new in the system. So they lack training.*

- ✚ Urdu version of ordinance 2001 "Local Body Plan" must be provided at all levels especially at UCs but in simple Urdu.

Ineffective Committees:

- ✚ *District Nazims' role must be abolished for the formation of district committees especial the safety commission*
- ✚ UCs Committees' Chairpersons, EDO, Responsible officers from related institutions should meet once a month with district committees' chairpersons to build a constructive environment.

Patriarchy and Women Councilors

UCs offices are in Hujras & Parks: It is nearly impossible for female councilors to join UCs meetings as UC offices are in Hujras and in parks. They have hardly invited for monthly meeting and it is not easy for labor or peasant councilor to join such meetings (as shared by labor female councilor, whenever she participates in meeting, factory owner cuts her wages).



The picture speaks for itself
Women Councilors-Zob

- ✚ Funding allocation for establishing the UC's office at appropriate government place
- ✚ Government must issue a notification to all such factories not to deduct salary in case of UCs meeting.

Funds are not allocated: Female councilors are not considered suitable for development schemes, so any funding allocation for them to be used in their respective constituencies.

- ✚ Independent funds must be allocated for women councilors.

Training: RB provided us training half in Urdu half in Pushto but ineffective. So for women councilors an independent training must be provided but in a simplistic manner.

Lesser opportunities to express their point of view: Women councilors have no say in local government system neither they have been ever informed about UCs' monthly meeting. Women have not yet provided those facilities which were promised before election.

- ✚ It was suggested to hold separate training by woman trainer to help and enable women councilors to be benefited from LGP ordinance 2001.
- ✚ Government must attract donors for education project in Balochistan. However, officially women primary education must be declared essential by the government.

THE WAY AHEAD

NATIONAL CONSULTATION MEETING:

National consultation meeting was organized on 7th June, 2002 at Ambassador Hotel-Lahore. More than 50 representatives of civil society and a large number of local government elected Councilors, *Niab Nazim* and *Nazim*, Media Representatives, civil society representatives and a *deputy secretary local government* Punjab “Latif Javaid” joined the consultation. We have invited other government representatives but:



Shahida Jameel-federal minister local government was not available. Where as, Danial Aziz from NRB and the minister local government Punjab ‘Hamid Saeed Akther’ who confirmed their availability but on the eleventh-hour, they regret due to their other commitments. It reflects their seriousness regarding the concerns of civil society (Where as, we have scheduled our national consultation on 7th June, 2002 with the mutual consent of Danial Aziz. Punjab Local government Minister ‘Hamid Saeed Akther’ was not only invited but also provided detail orientation on 6th June. During that meeting he reconfirmed his availability for few hours. But, on the last moment he sent the deputy secretary local government “Latif Javaid”.

The meeting started with a brief discussion by Mohammad Tahseen-executive director South Asia Partnership, about the study and the objectives of National consultation:

1. To share the findings;
2. To seek further suggestions/recommendations
3. To have an overview of government on the study.



He talked about the struggle of civil society groups in reference to **Devolution of Power**. During the negotiation with government (When the government announced devolution of power plan), it was clearly conveyed that:

1. people have a ritual to surrendered in favor the feudalism/elite culture exists in Pakistan as since the partition they have suffered due to it.
2. Secondly, bureaucracy who enjoys the freedom of power, would resist the plan.

Keeping in view these concerns it was stressed that rules and regulations need to be coined accordingly for a smooth functioning of LGP. Unfortunately, the same problems hold back the councils for a smooth functioning. Actually, the problem lies with the notion of devolution of power where as, power lies with people. Actually the system has become to centralized that, people are totally ignored by the state institution. He quoted few examples to elaborate his point by referring government

plans: **Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper** for next 10 years plan. Now the question is in a country where largely people are illiterate how this is possible for them to understand English document in case they have access to that. He further pointed out documents last 3 pages: Due to 11th September incident and constant threat from India we are increasing military budget so the agenda will/ may not be achieved. Now the fundamental question arises here why efforts to provides 97 pages paper if in the end nothing will be happened. Secondly, he referred **Interim Poverty reduction strategy paper** which claim to utilize Zaqat and Usher for poverty reduction.

Now we all know how these resources are always being utilized for personal political gain. The devolution of power plan is not possible until we consider important to work for an environment which ensures “people’s friendly policies”. Only people friendly policies can guarantee people will have access to:

1. information which is fundamentally essential to enjoy the right of expression;
2. the education, health, potable water, sanitation , shelter, employment opportunities and foreign policy.

But, we as Pakistani have a different scenario, power lies at the upper class/feudal which strengthened the elite culture and defuse the democratic environment. So it becomes important to help people in understanding the notion of power, which will further facilitate people’s political empowerment. If we have such an atmosphere only then, the success of devolution power plan will be successfully in place. With this note, Mohammad Tahseen invited Shabnam Rashid to provide a brief of the study.

PROCESS FOLLOWED DURING PROVINCIAL MEETINGS:

While providing briefing on the study, she quoted people who were very happy when the announcement made about the devolution of power plan. According to people they thought, their problems will be solved which will enable them to be empowered but, reality has a different picture. To assess the real picture SAP-PK has conducted a study with the objective to resolve the confusion, and support a dialogue among various partners, elected representatives, Federal government and National Reconstructive Bureau NRB. With this brief note she explained the details of the study. Groups were developed with the help of SAP-PKs’ Partners and 8 Focus group meetings at Lahore, Peshawar, Loralai, Zhob and Hyderabad. The group composition & an overview of the entire study including key points were shared by Shabnam Rashid:



Group Composition

PROFESSIONS	MEN	Women
Dev. Workers	24	18
Advocates	2	2
UC Secretary	1	1
Media Coordinator of UC	1	
Mechanics	2	
Journalists	5	
Farmers	3	2
Teachers	3	4
Student	5	2
Computer	2	2
Doctors	1	
Mason	1	
Govt. Representatives	4	
Retired Government Officer	4	
Labor / Peasant Councilor	5	13
G. Councilor	22	28
Niab Nazims	8	8
Niab	7	
Minority Councilor	6	1
Total	106	81

KEY FINDINGS:

After briefly explaining the process she shared the Key Findings of the study:

1. Nepotism And Local Body System

Federal Government, Local government system, NO Confidence Move & Nepotism:



- * To create balance, district Nazims' authority/powers should be transferred at Union Council level

Political affiliation, District Nazim, Nepotism and Referendum

- * Opposition role was strongly recommended for a constructive atmosphere.

Authoritarian Behavior and District Nazim

- Local Government Commission and District Mohtasib as narrated in local government ordinance immediately need to be in placed.

2. Bleak situation of the local government system:

Knowledge is half knowledge and Experience is other half

- It was suggested that UC, Tehsil and District councils must be granted a legal authority to transfer DCO and EDO.
- * The suggested Mechanism is to forward a no confidence move and approval will be taken through simple majority. Moreover, such decision will be forwarded to district Session Judge, to whom government should provide an authority for the implementation of all approved resolutions.

Monitor the performance of union administration

- * Elected representatives strongly suggested for UCs legal monitoring role in all such institutions which have direct effect in their particular constituency.

Lack of coordination among various institutions and the elected body

- * Question of decentralization can be solved by linking defense, finance, external and interior institutions with federal government and all other institutions ideally need to be linked with provincial, district and union council level.

3. Budget Allocation:

Lack of Funds at Union Councils (UCs):

City Municipal Development Department (CMDD) & Peshawar:

- * UCs should be authorized to use the resources they generate/collect. Moreover, underdeveloped UCs special funds need to be granted/ allocated by the District Councils.
- * Capital value tax, levied on selling of land of 8 Marlas or more, should be given to UC.

4. Patriarchy and women councilors

UCs offices are in Hujras & Parks:

Funds are not allocated:

Labor councilors and the deduction of their daily wages:



- * Funding allocation for establishing the UC's office at appropriate government place.
- * Independent funds must be allocated for women councilors.
- * Government must issue a notification to all such factories not to deduct salary in case of UCs meeting.

Lesser opportunities to express their point of view:

- * It was suggested to hold separate training by woman trainer to help and enable women councilors to be benefited from LGP ordinance 2001.
- * Government must attract donors for education project in Balochistan. However, officially women primary education must be declared essential by the government.

5. Lack Of Authority And Resources

Facilitate Poverty Reduction & Development Schemes:

- * Briefing on Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility must be given to elected representatives
- * Banks and other government schemes should be directly linked with UCs.
- * Khushali Banks should be formed at village and UC level, which will provided loans through people's committees. Moreover, UCs' Nazim must be authorized to take action in favor of respective constituencies.

6. Right To Information & Education

Lack of knowledge and training:



- * Urdu version of ordinance 2001 "Local Body Plan" must be provided at all levels especially at UCs but in simple Urdu.

7. Ineffective Committees:

- * District Nazims' role must be abolished for the formation of district committees especial the safety commission
- * UCs Committees' Chairpersons, EDO, Responsible officers from related institutions should meet once a month with district committees' chairpersons to build a constructive environment.

ADDITION TO The PROVINCIAL STUDY:

Suggestions/Concern by the participants of National Consultation: After the sharing participants were invited for further elaboration. The following concerns and suggestions were given (* reflected suggestion):

- 33% women representation but with out any authority---Approval system of simple majority constraint women to raised their concerns or enjoys approving authority during councils meeting (Swabi-NWFP's women councilors resigned) and most of them are forced to resign. Women councilors were saying if government can't change the situation then women seats should be eliminated:

- In case women are present in the session then, their point of views are hardly involved in the report (as they differ from others):
 - * Women representation must be declared essential for any approval during council's meeting by the government;
 - * Honoraria to women councilors must be provided in view of the existing patriarchal norms of the society;
 - * Gender orientation to all the elected representatives was strongly recommended to avoid gender segregation.
- Lack of clarity at all level especially at the speaker level:
 - * It was strongly recommended to provide training to all speakers involved in local bodies system.
- A contradiction in the system as Nazim and Niab Nazim's election were joint but, resources and authority lies with Nazim only which , creates problem in many places. Moreover, why authority was centralize at Town Nazim?

- * To create balance and enrich the philosophy of decentralization, district Nazims' authority/powers should be transferred at Union Council level.
- Lack of appropriate role for councilors in their related fields especially labor/farmers councilors:

- * It was recommended to assign the task to labor/farmers councilors in their respected fields
- Inefficient government school system because of existence of the dual education system in Pakistan which strengthened the class system in Pakistan:
 - * For an efficient government school system it was suggested that, all government officials as a policy matter should send their children to the government schools.
- Against UC's approved amount 5 lacks UC32 Lahore Nazim against 'the UC's approved amount 5 lacks' paid 10 lack to a certain constructor (The construction material was not adequate so the council again Resist not to pay but, Nazim by using his discretionary powers gave that amount paid 10 lack to a certain constructor. The construction material was not adequate so union council members resisted the payment should not be given to the constructor. But, Nazim used his discretionary powers paid the amount.
- * Union Council need to be granted powers to avoid such misuse of the resources.

- Citizen community Boards/ committees are still not in place



- * For citizen's effective participation in various boards/committees UC members and Nazim should call a public meeting and explained the procedures and the role of boards/committees.

- Minority, Labor/Farmers have no access to funds and responsibilities are not appropriate:

- * Separate funds/resources allocation for minority, labor/farmer and women councilors.
- * They must be assign tasks in their respective fields and notification to the respective institutions must be sent for a smooth and collaborated efforts.

GOVERNMENT POINT OF VIEW

After these suggestions, Deputy secretary local government Punjab was invited for his reflection. **Deputy secretary local government** briefly said first of all I would like to correct every one that, local government commission is in place and 4 members have also been selected who held their first meeting. ***But, participants were not aware about this who were primarily***



Deputy secretary local government Punjab

councilors. Deputy Secretary refused to accept the existing patriarchal norms and values as he said its' not true that decisions are made wit out women councilors' equal participation. He stressed that women are always there when the decisions are being made then, why this hue and cry. In relation to other problems he said, it's a new system so it will take its' own time to be effective.

Moreover, in relation to resources utilization/allocation he said, we should realize that Pakistan lacks the funds/resources. On the other hand, salaries of government officials utilized a large chunk of the available resources at provincial level. So its' not easy for the provincial government to fulfill the demands of LG system. He also shows his negligence to the plan by saying all the elected councilors are social workers rather government servants. So they could not be granted any salary or honoraria.

Participant said according to the ordinance 2001, local government elected representatives are government servants. Deputy secretary had a great criticism on the elected representatives but, have a little knowledge. He conclude his discussion by saying at the federal level the issue of honoraria is under discussion, so we have to wait for the results.

After his brief discussion, Mohammed Tahseen on behalf of all the participants raised few concerns regarding the honoraria of councilors. He said if the provincial and the national government elected representatives can claim their travel expenses and enjoys other benefits then, why this restriction to the local government representatives. Moreover,



Tahseen said, we all have a fundamental question if the commission is in place then, why this information was not shared with councils. Secondly, as a principle we should accept it that, all the elected representatives are government servants but, not the social workers. They are there to serve the people, if the opportunities and the enabling environment will not be provided then devolution of power plan will provide another gimmick of the state. As we all have a little faith in our state because during the local government elections the information was shared with the election commission: In NWFP 21 UC's women were not allowed to contest election. So under this circumstances all demanded to declared the elections in these areas null and void but, nothing happened. He concluded the meeting and invited them for refreshments & tea.

Note: One of the councilors pointed out one contradiction in the plan: Tehsil and district Niab Nazim are secretary of the councils but, UC's Niab Nazim isn't.

SUGGESTED FUTURE SCOPE:

After the entire consultative meeting it is strongly recommend that, SAP-PK or any such other organization/group can initiate a process for the empowerment of newly elected Local government representatives. The process will enhance their socio-political role which is essential for the political stability in Pakistan:

Complex Local Government Ordinance:

- Translation of the ordinance in local languages;
- Training to all elected representatives in their local languages;
- Separate training for women councilors by woman trainer to help and enable women councilors to be benefited from LGP ordinance 2001;

Gender Orientation:

- Gender orientation to all the elected representatives was strongly recommended to avoid gender segregation;
- Local Government Secretaries will be provided gender sensitization training;
- State Institutions which have a direct effect in the respective councils will be provided training;

Forming Women Councilors Networks:

- Women Councilors will be facilitated to form their network with various women councilors;
- Network members will be facilitated to conduct gender analysis of their respective constituencies;
- Accordingly, women councilors' network will be provided enhanced linkages for the initiation of sustainable projects in their constituencies;

Education:

- Adult education programs with the coordination of existing groups for the elected women Councilors;
- Attract donors for education project in tribal areas like; Balochistan and NWFP;
- Awareness raising campaign among various communities for a favorable women education process to be initiated;

Political Enlightenment and Women Councilors:

- Political Education: Selected councils will be provided detail orientation about their legal socio, political and economics rights;
- Detail orientation of the existing political parities and their role in Pakistan;

Facilitate Poverty Reduction & Linkages with Government department:

- Elected representatives will be provided training for the need prioritization, and plan accordingly;
- Selected councils will be provided facilitation to enhance their linkages with state institutions and with other concerned groups.